





AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

UNITED NATIONS ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

The Africa Regional Meeting on Sustainable Development Goals

Experts Segment

Addis Ababa, Ethiopia 31 October – 2 November 2013 Distr.: Limited

E/ECA/SDG/L 2 November 2013

Original: English

FINAL REPORT

I. Introduction

1. The Africa Regional Consultative Meeting on Sustainable Development Goals took place from 31 October to 5November 2013 at the headquarters of the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. The Meeting was organised jointly by the ECA, the African Union Commission (AUC) and the African Development Bank (AfDB). It comprised an experts segment held from 31 October to 2 November, and a ministerial segment held on 4 and 5 November, 2013.

2. The objectives of the Meeting were twofold: to enable African countries to identify, articulate and reach a consensus on the region's sustainable development priorities and goals, taking into account the outcomes of the Africa consultations on the Post-2015 Development Agenda; and to prepare Africa to speak with one strong voice and rally international support for the SDGs that were well aligned with the region's sustainable development priorities and aspirations, to serve as an input into the African Common Position on the Post-2015 Development Agenda.

3. This report documents the proceedings of the Experts Segment of the Meeting.

II. Attendance

4. The Meeting was attended by representatives of all 54 member States, namely: Algeria, Angola, Benin, Botswana, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Cameroon, Cape Verde, the Central African Republic, Chad, the Comoros, Cote d'Ivoire, the Republic of the Congo, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Djibouti, Egypt, Equatorial Guinea, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Gabon, the Gambia, Ghana, Republic of Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Kenya, Lesotho, Liberia, Libya, Madagascar, Malawi, Mali, Mauritania, Mauritius, Morocco, Mozambique, Namibia, the Niger, Nigeria, Rwanda, São Tomé and Principe, Senegal, Seychelles, Sierra Leone, Somalia, South Africa, South Sudan, Sudan, Swaziland, Tanzania, Togo, Tunisia, Uganda, Zambia and Zimbabwe.

5. The AUC, the AfDB, and the Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa (CODESRIA) also participated in the deliberations. Five of the African Union-recognized Regional Economic Communities (RECs) also took part in the deliberations. These were, namely; the Arab Maghreb Union (AMU), the Economic Community of Central African States (ECCAS), the

Community of Sahel Saharan States (CEN-SAD), the Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA), and the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD). Also present was the Lake Victoria Basin Commission of the East African Community Secretariat. The Pan African Postal Union (PAPU) and the Francophone International Organization were also represented. Major groups recognized at the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) in 1992, namely; business and industry, children and youth, farmers, indigenous peoples, local authorities, NGOs, scientific and technological community, women, as well as workers and trade unions were also actively engaged in the discussions.

6. Observers from the following member States of the United Nations were present: Austria, Brazil, Denmark, Mexico, Serbia and Iran. The European Union was also represented.

7. Observers from the following United Nations Agencies were present: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA), United Nations Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO), International Labour Organization (ILO), the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), the United Nations Industrial Development Organization(UNIDO), the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA), the International Organization for Migration (IOM), the World Health Organization (WHO), the United Nations Liaison Office with the African Union (UNLOAU), the World Food Programme (WFP), the Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS), UNWomen, the United Nations Office of the Special Advisor on Africa (OSAA), United Nations, Executive Office of the Secretary-General (EOSG)/Post-2015, United Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) and the World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO).

8. The complete list of participants can be accessed at: http://www.uneca.org/arcm-sdg2013

III. Opening of the meeting

9. The opening session of the meeting was moderated by Mr.BatholomewArmah, Chief of Renewal of Planning in the Macroeconomic Policy Division of ECA.

10. Opening statements were made by Ms. Fatima Denton, Coordinator of the African Climate Policy Centre (ACPC) and Officer-in-Charge of the Special Initiatives Division of ECA; Mr. Samba Harouna Thiam, SDGs Focal Point, United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP); Mr. Sarwar Hobohm, Director of Strategic Planning, United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO); Mr. Ayodele Odusola, Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) Advisor, United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Regional Bureau for Africa; Ms.Musole Mwila Musumali, African Development Bank; and Mr. Mohamed Khalil Timamy, Head, Environment and Natural Resources Division, African Union Commission. Ato Admasu Nebebe, Director of United Nations Agencies at the Regional Economic Cooperation Directorate in the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia delivered the keynote address and opened the meeting.

11. Speaking on behalf of Mr. Carlos Lopes, United Nations Under-Secretary-General and Executive Secretary of ECA, Ms. Fatima Denton welcomed participants to the meeting. She said that by convening the meeting, ECA, AUC and AfDB had demonstrated their commitment to supporting member States to pursue focused and coherent action on sustainable development. She reiterated the aims of the SDGs which were to guide and contribute to transformative change in support of a rights-based, equitable and inclusive approach to sustainability at global, regional, national and local levels. The intergovernmental process on the sustainable development goals was a follow-up to the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, which took place in Rio de Janeiro in June 2012. The milestones so far included the Africa Regional Implementation Meeting (Africa-RIM) for the Twentieth Session of the Commission on Sustainable Development (CSD-20), the engagement of African countries in the United Nations General Assembly Open Working Group on SDGs and the High-Level Committee on the Post-2015 United Nations Development Agenda.

12. The Africa Regional Consultative Meeting was important, as it was expected to carry the "African voice" to the global development agenda. While Africa was poised on a hopeful pathway,

as exemplified by the recurrent headline of "Africa on the rise", the continent still had several development paradoxes. Indeed, half the population still lived in extreme poverty, despite record economic growth and millions of hectares of uncultivated arable land; millions of people were still hungry and/or malnourished; climate change impacts were disproportionate, despite Africa contributing the least to historical emissions; and the huge natural resource wealth had not translated into significant progress towards the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Action should be taken to sustain current growth trends and address deficits in innovation, the bedrock of science and technology, so as to meet welfare needs and leverage growth. She also called for actions to address institutional gaps which she said was key for good governance. Moreover, effective policies, programmes and investments for addressing infrastructure gaps were needed, if the region was to take advantage of regional trade and technology developments.

13. Ms. Denton further called on the experts to reflect on Africa's priorities and expectations in the Draft Outcome Document to be adopted by the meeting. Africa must become the hub, if sustainable development was to deliver to its fullest potential. Transformation was crucial to achieving sustainable growth that would create jobs, particularly for the youth. Economic and structural transformation must be the feedstock for a sustainable development agenda, while poverty must be "snuffed out" so that it did not claim current and future lives and result in missed opportunities. The future that Africa wanted was that of shared prosperity for both current and future generations.

14. In his remarks, Mr. Samba Harouna Thiam, SDGs Focal Point, UNEP, said that one important message of the Rio+20 Conference was that the SDGs should carefully consider and balance the three dimensions of sustainable development. While countries were making commendable progress in meeting the MDGs, Africa's aggregate performance masked wide economic, social and spatial inequalities and governance challenges, and was too slow to meet the goals by 2015. Unemployment was high, especially among the youth, while malnutrition and lack of adequate access to health, education, water and energy were also a cause for concern. The slow progress towards meeting the MDG targets stemmed from the adverse effects of climate change, political instability and governance challenges.

15. Sustainable development should be enabled by integrating economic growth, social justice and environmental stewardship as guiding principles and operational standards. The new SDGs should also aim at eradicating all forms of poverty and integrating sustainable development in all its dimensions, balancing the economic, social and environmental dimensions in a way that would be aspirational, transformational, inclusive and universal in nature. A systematic framework for deciding on SDGs should ensure that the environment was embedded in the goals. There should also be a mechanism to track progress and a strong scientific basis for implementation and avoidance of critical irreversible changes to the global environment. Critical environmental sustainability issues should be covered and the current MDGs targets should serve as the base.

16. Speaking on behalf of Mr. LI Yong, the Director General of UNIDO, Mr. Sarwar Hobohm, Director of Strategic Planning at UNIDO expressed the organization's commitment to the process of the African common position on the Sustainable Development Goals, which was consistent with the organization's new vision, based on the concept of inclusive and sustainable industrial development. The concept would form the basis for a declaration that the member States of UNIDO were planning to adopt at their forthcoming General Conference in December 2013 in Lima.

17. The UNIDO Director General saw that approach as an effective means to ensure that industrial development continued to play its pre-eminent role as the key driver of economic diversification and transformative economic and social change, and as the sector that produced the economic wealth needed to meet the social and human welfare objectives of development. In that connection, industrial development had historically been the source of wealth creation, and thereby of sustained poverty reduction. UNIDO believed that the time had come for African countries to join the ranks of the industrialized countries of the North, the dragons and tigers of East and Southeast Asia and the BRICS countries.

18. An inclusive and sustainable approach to industrial development should embody energy efficiency, clean production, reduction of waste and pollution and an efficient and effective use of natural resources. There should also be close cooperation among all relevant development partners, including multilateral and bilateral development agencies, the international financial institutions, civil society and the private sector. The concept of inclusive and sustainable industrial development was

closely aligned with the priorities of the African Union and the views of the Economic Commission for Africa, as expressed in its Economic Report on Africa 2013. Lastly, UNIDO was ready to continue to support the endeavours of member States to achieve inclusive and sustainable industrial development for the benefit of the people of Africa.

19. In his remarks, Mr.Ayodele Odusola, MDGs Advisor, UNDP Regional Bureau for Africa, said that sustainable development, which was a mandate of UNDP, tried to correct the non-inclusive approach to development that focused mostly on the economic aspect of development at the expense of social and environmental considerations. Social inclusiveness should therefore be part and parcel of development goals. UNDP believed in development that was economically inclusive, socially responsive and equitable, and environmentally friendly.

20. Africa's development aspiration should be one that addressed the complex relationships among economic, social and environmental considerations. That called for: managing natural resources; ensuring that agricultural practices were environmentally friendly and socially responsible; managing the rising wave of large-scale land investment in Africa; promoting a diversified and efficient transport system; ensuring that growth was socially inclusive; promoting poverty eradication and advancing human capital; promoting efficient utilization of resources from natural endowment and sustainable adaptation strategy; ensuring that economic and social activities reinforced protection of Africa's environmental resources; and calling on advanced nations to support the African adaptation strategy in ways that promoted a resilient continent. The outcome of the meeting was an important component of the intergovernmental process established by the General Assembly to steer the discussion of the Open Working Group on Sustainable Development Goals.

21. In her remarks, Ms. Musumali the African Development Bank said that Africa faced significant challenges in meeting the MDGs. She explained that it was imperative that future development goals reflected Africa's specific circumstances and priorities. She called upon the experts to think carefully and critically about the future priorities that will help transform Africa towards achieving economic growth and eradication of poverty. She underscored lessons from the

MDGs, particularly the need to provide the means to implement goals, importance of institutions and other development enablers.

22. She said the meeting accorded Africa a chance to participate in the formulation of SDGs which she said would have a huge impact. She explained that the SDGs would shape development priorities and influence the flow of resources within and between nations and institutions. In this regard, she emphasized the need to improve the quality and effectiveness of the consultations to ensure that Africa's voice was heard in defining the Post-2015 development agenda. She further emphasized the need to build on the foundations of the MDGs to identify sustainable development priorities and key enabling factors. In this regard, she singled out leadership as critical in the negotiations. She also called for alignment of the consultative processes for the post 2015 agenda and the SDGs. She further called for a shift from the current development paradigm and trajectory towards a transition to 'green' development pathways in Africa, stressing that infrastructure was critical in the transformative agenda for Africa.

23. She reiterated the Bank's role in infrastructure development necessary for expanding economic opportunities and providing essential services in Africa. She said the Bank was ready to continue financing initiatives that support sustainable development and efforts towards transitioning to a greener development path on the continent. She expressed the hope that the hosting of this continent wide consultation would result in the articulation of an African Common Position on the SDGs.

24. In his remarks, Mr. Mohamed Khalil Timamy, representing Her Excellency Rhoda Peace Tumusiime, the AUC Commissioner for Rural Economy and Agriculture, said that many countries and key regional and international institutions had been reflecting on the global development programme to follow the MDGs after 2015. Progress in achieving the MDGs had been unsatisfactory, given that the goals were only the minimum targets required for sustainable development. The experts should consider whether the SDGs represented a continuation of trends experienced during the implementation of the MDGs. Despite their limitations and challenges, the essence embodied by the MDGs was irreplaceable. For Africa, the domestication of the yet-to-be agreed SDGs would entail reorientation of the values of Pan-Africanism to demonstrate unified efforts against social, political and environmental injustices.

25. Mr. Mohamed Khalil Timamy therefore called on the experts to avoid adopting an SDGs framework that bound Africa to a global regime of anachronism and inertia instead of adopting a framework that spoke to the African Renaissance to catalyse Africa's renewal in all its diversity. He also called on the international community to devote resources to the process of defining the Post-2015 development agenda between 2016 and 2030. He concluded by reiterating the commitment of AUC to continue working with ECA, AfDB, RECs, United Nations agencies and other partners during and after the consultation processes on the SDGs, and lift Africa to major heights of development.

26. In his keynote address, Ato Admasu Nebebe, Director of United Nations Agencies at the Regional Economic Cooperation Directorate of the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, welcomed the participants to Ethiopia. He reminded them of the decision reached by the Heads of State and Government and other high-level representatives to establish an inclusive and transparent intergovernmental process open to all stakeholders to define the SDGs to be agreed upon by the United Nations General Assembly. The objective of the meeting was to ensure that Africa championed its development agenda, articulated its aspirations and priorities and ensured that they were reflected in the SDG elaboration process, as well as integrated into the Post-2015 Development Agenda. Africa was called upon not to lose sight of addressing the key challenges required to consolidate growth, such as creating jobs, promoting inclusive growth, and achieving structural transformation. The experts were therefore called upon to ensure that the goals to be agreed delivered investments for economic transformation and addressed the energy deficiency on the continent.

27. Ato Admasu said that Ethiopia was implementing a growth and transformation plan (GTP) aimed at a major strategic shift to embark on a transformational growth trajectory to become a middle-income country by 2025. He explained that the GTP takes into account all dimensions of sustainable development, and places high priority on investments in pro-poor sectors including energy for all, rural roads, railway, health and education. The country was also committed to building a climate-resilient and green economy. He called on the experts to ensure that the outcome of the meeting propose Africa-driven goals that would encapsulate the continent's development

priorities that placed sustainability as a central strand of the Post-2015 Development Agenda. Also, the meeting should ensure that the SDGs formulated would converge with the consultations on the Post-2015 Development Agenda as one integrated development framework at the global level, thus eliminating multiple national planning frameworks.

28. He underscored the need for Africa to own the global development agenda. In this regard, he recounted Africa's development challenges and explained that the SDGs should prioritize and deliver investments to strengthen Africa's growth engine, particularly infrastructure and energy development. He said this was the time and an opportunity for Africa to agree on goals that will address the dire energy poverty that was affecting millions of people on the continent. He emphasised that the acute energy insecurity in Africa was fuelled by the general stagnation in sustainable energy development in Africa. He noted in particular that despite the continent's energy potential, only twenty per cent of Africa's population had direct access to electricity and 70 per cent of the population in Sub-Saharan Africa lived without access to clean and safe energy for cooking, lighting and heating.

29. He therefore singled out lack of access to energy and stagnation of energy development as major impediments to industrial development in Africa which he said were deterring diversification of exports, jobs creation and economic transformation of the continent. He explained that without adequate and reliable sources of energy Africa will continue to export wealth and jobs in the form of unprocessed and no or low value-added commodities. Further, he explained that lack of access to renewable, clean and affordable energy was putting pressure on Africa's natural forests and biodiversity and was undermining climate change adaptation efforts.

30. He concluded that there were high prospects for African countries to individually and collectively continue to rise and achieve greater competiveness at the global level. In this regard, he called for unity of purpose and coherence in Africa's engagement with the international community. He called on the experts to agree on the draft outcome document to be presented to ministers, and to articulate clear strategies to promote Africa's common position to ensure that the continent's priorities feature prominently in the frameworks that will shape and drive development across the globe.

31. He then declared the Experts Segment of the Africa Regional Consultative Meeting on the Sustainable Development Goals open and wished the experts success in their work.

IV. Organizational matters

A. Election of the Bureau

32. The member States present at the Africa Regional Consultative Meeting on Sustainable Development Goals elected the following countries to constitute its Bureau, based on equitable subregional representation:

Chairperson:	Liberia
First Vice-Chair:	Chad
Second Vice-Chair:	Zimbabwe
Third Vice-Chair:	Egypt
Rapporteur:	Ethiopia

B. Adoption of the agenda and programme of work

33. The Chair of the elected Bureau called for a discussion of the draft agenda. The agenda was adopted with a minor amendment to item 4. The member States agreed to consider "Progress on consultations on the Post-2015 Development Agenda".

34. The meeting urged the Secretariat to ensure that the working document of the Draft Outcome Document was circulated in good time to enable the participants to study the draft and adequately prepare for the meeting.

V. Introduction and objectives of the meeting

35. Under this agenda item, the Secretariat made a brief presentation on the introduction and objectives of the meeting. It provided an overview of the meeting background, objectives, format and expected outcomes. The meeting was in two main parts: the experts segment and the Ministerial segment. The main expected outcomes of the meeting were: Enhanced understanding of Africa's Post-2015 Development Priorities and priority sustainable development issues; High-level political guidance and consensus on achieving convergence between the Post-2015 Development Agenda and the SDGs process; and Guidance and strategies for Africa's unified approach to the global level consultations and negotiations on SDGs and the Post-2015 Development Agenda.

36. Participants were urged to complete the registration form to enable the Secretariat to effectively disseminate and follow-up on the implementation of the outcomes of the meeting.

VI. Presentation and discussion on the African Common Position on the Post-2015 Development Agenda

37. Mr. Dossina Yeo of the African Union Commission presented the background and processes that led to the preparation of the draft African Common Position on the Post-2015 Development Agenda which was mandated by the AU Heads of State and Government Summit of 2010, and July 2012. The continent had a major stake in the Post-2015 Development Agenda because the region was least likely to achieve all the MDG targets by 2015. The African Common Position was formulated based on a set of guiding principles which included: (a) the need for a balance between social and economic development; (b) ownership and accountability to domestic stakeholders; (c) access to good quality social services; (d) reduced inequality; (e) the need for capacity to measure performance; (f) the need for one development agenda; and (g) a focus on development outcomes and enablers.

38. A draft African Common Position, based on the consultations was presented to the AU Summit of Heads of State and Government in May 2013. The Summit established the High-Level Committee (HLC), chaired by Her Excellency Mrs. Ellen Sirleaf Johnson of Liberia and mandated it to continue consultations to enrich the draft common position. The Summit also requested AUC, ECA, AfDB, UNFPA and UNDP to support the HLC. Following that decision, further consultations were held with the African Group in New York and Geneva, the Permanent Representatives Council (PRC) in Addis Ababa, member States and the World Bank Group of African Executive Directors.

The process led to the identification of five priority areas namely: (a) structural economic transformation and inclusive growth; (b) science, innovation, and technology; (c) people-centred development; (d) environmental sustainability and natural disaster risk reduction and management; and (e) financing and partnerships. In addition, a number of enablers were identified including peace and security, human rights, governance, regional integration, and sound macroeconomic policies.

39. The HLC had developed a roadmap for the finalization of the common position. The Committee held its inaugural meeting in September 2013. The technical working group also held a meeting on 25 and 26 October 2013 to discuss and incorporate comments received from stakeholders. That was followed by a Sherpa meeting on 28 and 29 October 2013 with representatives of the Africa Group in New York and Geneva and the PRC to agree on the priority areas identified. The HLC would meet in December 2013 in N'Djamena to finalize the African Common Position, which would be presented during the AU Summit in January 2014. As the African Common Position was still being formulated, the HLC continued to receive comments for inclusion. The outcome of the Africa Regional Consultative Meeting would feed into the ongoing work of the HLC in articulating the African Common Position. The outcome of the meeting should be provided to the HLC for inclusion in the African Common Position.

40. The ensuing discussions centred on the need for convergence between the Post-2015 and SDG processes. A number of participants expressed the view that the two processes should not happen in parallel. It was therefore commendable that Africa had started the process towards convergence with the establishment of the HLC which would articulate Africa's Common Position on the Post-2015 Development Agenda into which the outcome of the current meeting should be integrated.

41. The content of the draft African Common Position and priority areas identified focused more on what Africa wanted and less on how to engage the international community. The Post-2015 Development Agenda was a global agenda, unlike the MDGs, which were meant for developing countries. It was about sharing global public goods and what was at stake. In the area of the environment for example, developed countries would be largely responsible for mitigation, while developing countries should be given means such as technology and finance to meet some targets. Africa therefore needed to look at the agenda critically in order to avoid straight-jacketing the continent's growth.

42. While the draft African Common Position identified the continent's priorities, the document should be discussed further and the priorities highlighted. They included domestic resource mobilization, partnerships, growth for poverty reduction, independence and impartial administration of justice; and funding in a broader sense. The Secretariat assured participants that the process of formulating the African Common Position was ongoing and open to comments, and therefore the concerns expressed by the participants would be taken into account. The outcome document of the meeting would be inputted into the African Common Position on the Post-2015 Development Agenda.

VII. Presentations and discussions on the subregional reports on the Sustainable Development Goals

Presentation and discussion on the Sustainable Development Goals for Central Africa

Presentation

43. Mr. Thaddee Yossa, ECA consultant, gave a presentation based on the draft Sustainable Development Goals Report for Central Africa. The presenter outlined the context and objectives of the report and indicated that the methodology used for the report was based on documentary review and broad consultations with stakeholders through formal meetings, questionnaires and e-mails. He highlighted the nine sustainable development priorities of the Central African subregion: peace, security and socio-political stability; governance and accountability; physical infrastructure; poverty, food security and sovereignty; green growth and creation of decent jobs; improved access to healthcare for all; improved access to quality education and vocational training for all; environmental protection; and social inclusion, gender equality and women's empowerment. Central Africa was endowed with rich natural resources, but was also facing challenges in terms of governance, security and demographic pressure.

44. The report proposed nine sustainable development goals with associated targets and indicators for Central Africa before drawing attention to the related risk factors. The presentation ended with recommendations on the implementation of the proposed SDGs to national governments, subregional organizations, civil society and the international community.

Discussion

45. Participants from Central Africa commended the good quality of the report, which reflected the realities of the subregion and addressed most of their concerns. However, issues such as corporate social responsibility, management of petroleum wastes, illicit enrichment, desertification, financing mechanism, social impact of artisanal and illegal mining and land tenure, needed more attention.

46. Plans were well underway for setting up a green economy fund for Central Africa. Delegates from the subregion recommended that a sustainable development index combining the human development index and carbon footprint should be elaborated at the global level.

Presentation and discussion on the Sustainable Development Goals for Eastern Africa

Presentation

47. Mr. Richard Ngendehayo, ECA consultant gave a presentation based on the report on Sustainable Development Goals for Eastern Africa. He outlined the major sustainable development issues in the Eastern Africa subregion, priority sustainable development areas and proposed sustainable development goals, targets and indicators. The Eastern Africa subregion report analysed and provided insights into the different social, economic and environmental priorities that needed to be pursued in order to achieve the laudable national and subregional development objectives and overall sustainable development. Those were translated into specific proposed sustainable development goals and targets, as well as indicators that were intended to inspire focused and accelerated actions to promote sustainable development in the subregion and the implementation of sustainable development programmes and actions. A key message was that Eastern Africa member States had similar physical features and resources and hence could further build on platforms

provided by Regional Economic Communities (RECs) and intergovernmental organizations to address challenges in achieving sustainable development.

48. The major sustainable development issues for the Eastern Africa subregion, included high poverty levels, high unemployment rates, inequitable growth and inequality, high population growth, poor health and prevalence of diseases such as HIV, high illiteracy rates, food insecurity and persistent hunger, unsafe water and poor sanitation, air pollution, negative impacts of climate change, land degradation and desertification, unreliable energy sources, and increased security concerns and peace-building. Drawing from the analysis of those issues in national and subregional strategic documents, priority intervention areas for sustainable development at both levels were identified in the report. Those areas involved incorporating policy action into poverty reduction strategies, as well as the formulation and implementation of programmes and projects to foster socioeconomic development, including sound environmental management in the subregion.

49. The report defined SDGs based on identified areas. The proposed seven SDGs were: (a) eradication of extreme poverty; (b) food security and adequate nutrition; (c) reduced rate of unemployment; (d) increased and improved existing infrastructure; (e) improved access to health facilities; (f) improved educational facilities; and (g) promotion of efficient use of natural resources. With a view to achieving SDGs, Eastern African countries should commit to: (i) increasing public finances to sustainable development; (ii) mainstreaming sustainable development into subregional and national development policies, strategies and programmes; (iii) enabling the formulation, implementation and monitoring of sustainable development strategies; (iv) encouraging sharing of experiences and scaling-up sustainable development strategies; and (v) establishing formal and non-formal education and sensitization programmes on sustainable development.

Discussion

50. The report should recognize the typology of post-conflict member States in the subregion such as Somalia and South Sudan and that of Small Island Developing States (SIDS) and Indian Ocean islands such as the Comoros and Seychelles. That necessitated the formulation of tailor-made sustainable development programmes, which addressed their specific attributes and needs. The bulk

of the population in the subregion was still very poor, although a number of countries had recorded impressive economic growth rates.

51. The blue economy was vital to countries such as Seychelles and the Comoros. The specific problems of SIDS were more existential than developmental. Indeed, island States ran the risk of disappearing due to rise in sea level; hence the need to consider climate refugees (10 per cent of the coastal population would be displaced by 2020), and loss of land to marine intrusion (734 ha would be lost by 2020) as key components. One of the elements to be considered by the goals was the issue of marine pollution risks caused by oil tankers.

52. South Sudan said that although they had joined the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) and the East African Community (not yet official) their country had not been adequately covered in the report.

53. Industrialization had not been adequately covered or considered on the path towards sustainable development. There was a need to clarify the approach to be adopted to achieve industrialization. The issue was whether to favour technology imports or support existing human capacity and innovation potential. It would not be possible for countries to move to higher levels of income without industrialization, which could be achieved through enhanced energy mix and infrastructure expansion, such as information and communication technologies (ICTs), which had already played an instrumental role in transformational change.

54. Human capital was vital to the sustainability of the economy. Education and health-related priorities should be emphasized, with special focus on girls' education, free education and healthcare. The report should propose the development of linkages to the labour market and skills development, to further address the issue of social protection, gender, people with disabilities, youth and youth unemployment. Also, early childhood care and development contributed to increased productivity and quality of life. Gender inequality should be further addressed through equal opportunities in the workplace and access to property rights. The dimension of access to quality education and health services seemed to be missing in the report.

55. Insufficient infrastructure was one of the major constraints to integration of economies and intraregional trade hence the need for an "infrastructure vision" (Seychelles). IGAD mentioned that the report needed to refer to various existing policy and strategic documents and include further information on natural resources, environmental impact assessments and disaster risk management. Railways should be added to infrastructure.

56. Attention should be paid to nomadic/pastoralist and agriculture systems in countries like Somalia, where clean drinking water was a challenge for 70 per cent of the population. Social security was essential to lift the population from poverty, while the creation of equitable partnerships was equally considered important.

57. More importance should be accorded to the issue of peace and security in the subregion with reference to human trafficking, illicit drugs and piracy.

58. Sustainable development platforms should be established at all levels. The report should further highlight cities and urban settlements as over 60 per cent of the population would be living in urban areas in the near future. The issue of migration to urban centres and slums should also be addressed.

59. It was recommended that financing for development should be a key component of the sustainable development goals. Resource mobilization should include both domestic and foreign investments.

60. Access to knowledge and information technology was key to increasing competitiveness. There was a disparity between information on regional priorities contained in Eastern Africa and Africa reports.

Presentation and discussion on the sustainable development goals for Southern Africa

Presentation

61. Dr. Sithabiso Gandure, ECA consultant, gave a presentation based on the draft report on sustainable development goals for Southern Africa. She highlighted the overall design of SDGs for the subregion, noting that the goals had been based on a unified concept with the ultimate goals of human development and improved human well-being. The process of defining the SDGs drew lessons from the major strengths of the MDGs that led to their high level of global acceptance, parsimony and measured outcomes. The Southern Africa study had identified six SDGs, namely: (a) sustainable poverty eradication; (b) improved learning (education and technical) attainment; (c) promotion of gender equality and social inclusion; (d) improved health and nutrition status; (e) environmental sustainability; and (f) improved governance.

62. Implementation of the SDGs must be supported through clear monitoring and evaluation mechanisms and lessons from the MDG success story. The SDGs should be used to formulate national budgets and balance economic, social and environmental pillars in policymaking. SDG targets should be common to all countries but differentiated by the indicators, depending on country characteristics and level of development. In implementing the goals, country finance commitments should be the first option, followed by Official Development Assistance (ODA). The report underscored the need for capacity-building and technical skills development in support of the implementation of the SDGs. Such capacity-building initiatives should encompass training on defining indicators and collection of data to strengthen monitoring and evaluation at the regional level.

Discussion

63. Following the presentation on the SDG report for Southern Africa, the meeting thanked the consultant for the information in the document and indicated areas for further improvement. The participants noted that the methodology used for collecting data was for report preparation was inadequate, given that consultant did not visit the countries to consult the relevant ministries in member States of the subregion.

64. The report did not adequately cover land management, fisheries, livestock development and infrastructure issues. Concerns on financing and the strategic role of domestic resource mobilization

to foster SDGs implementation were lacking and needed to be strengthened. The SDG targets mentioned were not clearly defined and additional work was also needed on the set of indicators proposed.

65. Issues and challenges on rural-urban growth and development disparities were raised, indicating that rural-urban migration was becoming a serious concern for the subregion. Development should be taken to rural zones to address the poor access to water, clean energy and basic infrastructure by the rural population.

66. There was a strong recommendation to link the current discussion on SDGs with those on the post-2015 development agenda.

67. Account should be taken of the special needs of landlocked and island countries. Emphasis was placed on the need to organize wider subregional consultations to review the report and ensure ownership of the whole process by the subregion. Relevant subregional institutions should also meet to provide information for the revised report. There was also a need to strengthen the recommendations and conclusions of the report and highlight them in the document.

68. While the goals emerging from the unfinished MDG Agenda were adequately addressed, the priorities linked to the issues were not sufficiently dealt with. Regarding the economic pillar, the report was weak on infrastructure development, employment, especially youth unemployment, energy and regional integration, and on the environment pillar, most of the targets were "reductionist", calling for the inclusion of the much needed adaptive indicators.

69. The Secretariat was urged to ensure the improvement of the report, particularly on governance issues and their linkages with sustainable development, and not to dwell solely on the Ibrahim Mo index, which was not well recognized internationally.

70. The need to harmonize the 2040 timeframe adopted by the report with other engagements and initiatives at the global level and within the United Nations was underscored, noting that the United Nations Secretary-General had adopted 2030 as the timeline for his initiative on poverty reduction.

71. Concern was raised over the long list of goals, which was one of the factors for poor progress on the MDGs. The SDGs were therefore to be built on the recommendations from the Rio+20 process calling for a set of indicators which were precise, implementable and capable of mobilizing the necessary financial support for implementation.

72. The women major group thanked the consultant for mainstreaming issues relating to gender and the youth and proposed that the SDG process should go beyond quantitative indicators on gender and human development to incorporate the transformative aspect of the issues.

Presentation and discussion on the sustainable development goals for North Africa

Presentation

73. Mr. Mohamed Saleck, ECA Consultant gave a presentation based on the draft report on sustainable development goals for North Africa. The presentation first highlighted the method used to draft the document, which was in three phases: (a) general and specific literature review of documentation produced by countries and the subregion on sustainable development; (b) analysis and national consultations on the post-2015 agenda and merging with the priorities adopted; and (c) interviews with international and subregional institutions.

74. The second part of the presentation reviewed the main subregional priorities, which were economic, social and environmental as well as crosscutting: (a) integration of the three pillars of sustainable development; (b) green economy; (c) regional integration; (d) governance; and (e) resource mobilization.

75. Based on the above, priority issues were identified. Some major issues for the subregion, had not been taken into account by the MDGs, but were key to the achievement of sustainable development. They included governance, anti-corruption, climate change, green economy, employment and regional disparities.

76. The issues were then compared with those identified by the countries during the national consultations on the post-2015 development agenda. It led to four overall objectives, 30 targets and 48 indicators.

77. The report also highlighted a number of risks that could affect the implementation and proposed the following recommendations to ensure that the exercise did not fail: (a) strengthening national production systems and data analysis; (b) building capacities for better ownership of the SDGs and their underlying systematic approach; (c) implementing training and information programmes on the green economy (approach, principles, tools and sustainable development gains); (d) fundraising (including domestic); (e) setting up a planning and regular monitoring system for SDG implementation; and (f) coordinating national, subregional and international stakeholders.

Discussion

78. Some member States said that their observations were only preliminary. They would make further observations and comments to ECA, once the report had been considered by the technical departments in each country. The full report should also be circulated to participants for them to have a complete picture so as to provide their comments.

79. The issue of energy security was not only to do with renewable energy, but also energy efficiency, which should be taken into account given the short-term economic and environmental gains. Emphasis should also be placed on affordable energy.

80. The importance of sustainable management of underground water should be covered in the report.

81. Needs of population living in vulnerable situations should be taken into account.

82. Areas such as risk management, infrastructure needs, non-monetary dimension of poverty, economic competitiveness, gender equality, impact of demographic transition and efficient information systems should be better developed.

83. The report should consistently use economic growth rather than green economy.

84. There should be improved balance between analysis made in the document, especially priorities, and the SDG matrix;

85. The following among other issues should be better highlighted: poverty reduction, which had been made a target; desertification; economic growth and transformation; improved quality of education and access to knowledge; youth employment and food and energy security.

86. In the SDG matrix, economic dimension, especially improving competitiveness should be highlighted and better articulated;

87. Specific target on control of forest degradation should be added;

88. There was a need to improve analysis of link between food security, water scarcity, desertification and climate change and show how to address constraints to increase agricultural productivity;

89. Include analysis of impact of the international context on food security by focusing on subsidy, trade and technology transfer issues;

90. Review consistency of fourth intervention area and prove its rationale- The target on infrastructure which had not been adequately addressed should be included;

91. On climate change, it was recommended that the importance of the "adaptation" dimension should be highlighted, and not only the "mitigation effects" (This should be highlighted in the SDG matrix);

92. Oases were fragile but important ecosystems in the subregion. The report needed to mention this aspect. A specific target should be included in the SDG matrix;

93. The report should provide figures that were consistent with available national data and statistics.

Next steps

94. Participants said that the report should be further discussed and validated. They proposed that subregional consultation meeting involving the main stakeholders should be organized in that regard.

Presentation and discussion on the sustainable development goals for West Africa

Presentation

95. Dr. Daniel Kwabena Twerefou, ECA Consultant made the presentation based on the draft report on sustainable development goals for West Africa. The objective of the report was to identify,

analyse and articulate the main priority areas/themes of sustainable development for West Africa and formulate the SDGs, taking into account data availability. It was also to propose a concise set of SDGs, targets and indicators as well as provide a well-informed and action-oriented strategy for the operationalization/implementation of the proposed SDGs in the subregion. There was a review of all regional, subregional and global reports and publications on priority sustainable development issues and challenges, as well as a survey and key stakeholder consultations to determine priority SDGs in the subregion and consultation with key officials.

96. The presenter provided a summary of socioeconomic and environmental developments in West African countries in recent years, highlighting the challenges in several dimensions of human development such as education, health, access to drinking water and basic infrastructure services. Poverty was a major challenge, in Nigeria for example, where youth unemployment was higher than total unemployment, especially among graduates and females. Some environmental challenges faced by the subregion were rising greenhouse gas emissions, land degradation and depletion of soil nutrients due to soil erosion, desertification, unsustainable exploitation of forest resources and degradation of aquatic environments, which contribute significantly to the livelihoods of coastal communities.

97. The West Africa subregion had prioritized goals with their associated targets and indicators as follows: (a) reduce extreme poverty and hunger; (b) achieve gender equality and equitable universal primary and secondary education; (c) improve child and maternal health; (d) ensure universal access to health care delivery; (e) increase and improve infrastructure and urban management; (f) improve inclusive economic growth; (g) achieve structural economic transformation; (h) ensure good governance, peace and security; (i) reduce environmental pollution; and (j) develop regional and global public-private partnerships for development.

98. Recommendations included the need to consider the development of a subregional sustainability index to concisely monitor the implementation of sustainable development and learn from the implementation of the MDGs. Countries should have more platforms to share experiences and knowledge and better networking in the implementation of the SDGs at the operationalization phase and receive support to resolve data and monitoring and evaluation issues. There should be

genuine commitment to make aid effective by meeting pledges, promoting, facilitating and financing appropriate technologies to support the operationalization and implementation of the SDGs. Likewise, there should be direct support toward capacity-building, institutional strengthening and beneficial public-private and local-foreign partnerships.

Discussion

99. The experts commended the consultant for the report presented for their consideration. Although the report took into account all aspects of sustainable development, the social pillar was not exhaustively captured. Gender equality targets and indicators were also not properly captured in the report. In particular, the indicator of the ratio of boys to girls in school was inadequate for gender parity. There was a need to define proper indicators such as access to land and other resources, access to education as well as indicators for measuring the issues proposed in the report as sustainable development themes for the subregion.

100. The issues of persons with disability, indigenous peoples, the elderly, women and children were not adequately addressed. Social inclusion and human rights were highlighted as critical for the subregion. Social protection was also highlighted as an area that needed to be included, as West Africa was one of the poorest subregions in Africa.

101. Land tenure, scarcity of arable land and migration were identified as some of the causes of conflict in the region. It was recommended that member States should strengthen their land tenure legislations to manage land grabbing incidents by multinational companies.

102. Africa was recording good economic performance figures yet, there were not enough jobs being created. There was a need for thorough analysis of the situation on the ground, and also for innovation so that the continent could achieve technological development.

103. The informal sector was dynamic and played an important role in the West African economy although most informal activities were not recorded in official statistics. The level of poverty may be lower, taking into consideration the role of the informal sector in the subregion.

104. The role of culture in a harmonious and dynamic society was highlighted. Culture provides values for people, thus development without cultural benchmarks is fragile. It was proposed that culture should be identified as a priority development goal in the framework of the SDGs.

105. Environmental concerns were not adequately addressed. Climate change, biodiversity loss, urban waste, chemical waste and other important elements were also not covered. The impact of climate change on Africa was more important than reducing emissions from the subregion, which were significantly lower than global emissions. There was a need to stress that water and desertification were regional concerns. Land degradation and not just soil degradation were issues for some countries in the subregion, particularly those faced with the effects of drought and desertification. Land degradation and migration due to climate change were considered paramount in some countries. However, the positive impact of migration should also be analysed, particularly the role of remittances from the diaspora.

106. Coastal erosion linked to sea level rise that leads to submergence and disappearance significant areas of island States were highlighted as important environmental concerns.

107. There was a need to expand on the implementation strategies proposed to include innovative ways of financing, to complement remittances and ODA, promoting technical and vocational training, controlling use of pesticides and chemicals in agriculture, among other things. There was also a need to analyse the impact of capital flight on the economies in the subregion, and understand its destination. Participants also proposed introduction of innovative ways of financing.

108. Financing mechanisms must be sustainable and at the same time aim at reducing dependence on foreign aid. The strategies for reducing donor funding should also explain how countries in the subregion could increase domestic resource mobilization. Some of the goals within the complex set of goals proposed should be implemented as a priority. Member States' capacities should be built to implement the goals within a prescribed timeframe. 109. Environmental issues should be highlighted in the planning process, as observed at the Rio+20 meeting. Likewise, activities for the management of natural resources, chemical wastes and other environmental considerations should be prioritized for the subregion.

110. The gender perspectives should be mainstreamed into all the SDGs

111. The education goal did not include targets and indicators on the quality of education. There was a need to define an indicator to capture the quality of education as well as targets for women's empowerment. The indicator for women's representation in legislative bodies was inadequate and difficult to track. Similarly, the indicator for infant mortality should not have a strict minimum.

112. The infrastructure target should include rural roads to facilitate access to basic social services, and connection between consumption and production areas. On transport infrastructure, there was a need to include marine and rail transport, which were crucial for trade and regional integration. There was also a need to assess the quality of public investment in infrastructure as better health and education facilities were necessary to support other goals.

113. GDP per capita income was not an adequate indicator to measure inclusive growth (goal) and therefore more indicators should be introduced. Volatility of economic growth, due to weather patterns, was also highlighted as one of the economic challenges for sustainable development in the subregion.

114. There was a need to underscore the role of the private sector, even if the State played the lead role in the economy. Equally important were good governance and the need to rebuild countries that were just coming out of conflict.

115. The extractive (mining) industry was identified as one of the main drivers of economic growth in the subregion. It was however important to analyse the contribution of the sector to the welfare of the people of the subregion. The sector was largely in transition, with many artisanal miners. There should be working relations between the mining companies and the artisanal miners, emphasizing local content, to enhance distribution of benefits to the local economy. The potential

danger of extractive industry on education through school drop-outs, and waste chemicals from mining should be addressed.

116. The themes of poverty and hunger were interlinked, and were therefore expected to be treated as such in the proposed SDGs. Increasing productivity of the agriculture sector could help in reducing poverty. Managing post-harvest losses would reduce poverty and enhance food security in the subregion.

117. The report made too many vague recommendations. The economic analysis on effects of structural adjustment in Cote d'Ivoire was disputed. However, there was general agreement that unemployment, especially youth unemployment as well as unemployment in other categories of the labour force, was a major cause for concern in the entire region.

118. There was a need to reintegrate former fighters, militants, and persons associated with conflict into alternative occupation, social and economic life especially in countries coming out of conflict. Post-conflict reconstruction was also highlighted as an opportunity for growth and creating jobs for the youth.

119. There was concern that issues of human trafficking, forced labour, child labour and social issues such as beggars in urban areas had not been captured as development problems in the subregion.

120. Regional integration was hailed as important for the growth of the subregion, which still grappled with the lingua divide between francophone and Anglophone countries.

121. Urbanization was a serious issue because of lack of jobs in rural areas, while migration to coastal cities was a growing problem because of inland environmental pressures, including desertification, lack of water and drought.

122. Long-term strategies should be developed to operationalize the goals. Tools should be identified to operationalize the goals at the Africa regional level, and the indicators must be objective

and SMART. There was a need to identify linkages between the proposed SDGs. There was also a need to make some of the policies and frameworks mandatory through legislation, although caution was necessary not to over-legislate development goals.

123. It was clarified that Nigeria was making strides in sanitation services and provision of water contrary to what is in the report and this should be rectified.

124. There was a need for a subregional forum to discuss and update the report and also to ensure ownership of the process, interventions and the proposal in the document. Institutions should also work together to provide disaggregated data.

125. Analysis should be enriched by reports produced by national institutions and subregional institutions rather than those produced by the World Bank, IMF and other organizations. There is a need to present country situations to assess the weaknesses and strengths of each country with respect to the proposed goals.

126. Conflicts along transhumance corridors and coastal areas should be managed in the subregion. Management of shared river basins and conservation of traditional values of populations were key to sustainable development in the subregion.

127. On governance, corruption was an impediment to attaining sustainable development in the subregion. Increasing budget allocation to anti-graft institutions while failing to address income differentials within governments was an inadequate indicator for fighting corruption. There was a need to increase access to justice by providing more courts and increasing the number of magistrates and judicial workers. Transparency was also highlighted as an important governance objective, particularly through increased access to information.

128. Consistency and continuity of partnerships to follow through commitments and pledges were critical in meeting the proposed goals. Some of the proposed themes were not comprehensive.

Overall comment and recommendation on all the subregional reports:

129. The meeting noted that the draft reports were very useful and important in informing the consultations on the SDGs and other planning processes at subregional and national levels. However these reports should be subjected to consultative processes in the various subregions for validation. The meeting therefore recommended that ECA, AUC and AfDB, in collaboration with the regional economic communities, should use existing forums to facilitate subregional consultations. Subsequently, the reports should be disseminated widely.

VIII. Presentation and discussions on the Africa regional report on the sustainable development goals

Presentation

130. Dr. Genevesi Ogiogio, ECA consultant, made the presentation based on the draft Africa Regional Report on the Sustainable Development Goals which underlined proposals on Africa's SDGs, targets and indicators for further consultation and refinement. The presentation highlighted the key elements of sustainable development for economic growth, social development, environmental sustainability, good governance and effective institutions. He provided the rationale for the sustainable development goals. The proposed SDGs were based on a time horizon of three decades, 2015-2045; guiding principles, including the Rio Principles and priorities covering sustainable economic development, sustainable social development, sustainable environmental development and governance, peace and security.

131. Twelve SDG targets and indicators were proposed for the Africa region, namely: (a) eradicate poverty and hunger and achieve food and nutrition security; (b) vigorously promote good governance, peace and security; (c) provide adequate, qualitative, affordable and accessible health care for all; (d) enhance accessibility and affordability of quality education for all; (e) improve availability and accessibility of clean water and sanitation for all; (f) intensify gender equality, women empowerment and youth development; (g) ensure social inclusion and security for all; (h) transform from conventional to inclusive green growth; (i) scale up investments in infrastructure development and

efficient services; (j) advance sustainable exploitation, use and management of natural resources; (k) improve environmental quality; and (l) promote global partnerships and institutional effectiveness.

132. The means of implementation for SDGs were: domestic and external financial resource mobilization; education and capacity development; regional integration; trade and market access, development and transfer of environmentally sound technologies: good governance and effective institutions; South-South cooperation; and reform of international financial and development institutions. There was also a need for monitoring and evaluation of SDGs at all levels – local, national, subregional, regional and global. ECA should work with other regional institutions to develop and apply appropriate monitoring and evaluation frameworks and databases for the SDGs. Also, ECA, AUC, the NEPAD Agency and AfDB should regularly convene consultative meetings and lead processes to monitor and evaluate implementation progress. Furthermore, leadership participation and implementation frameworks should be strengthened through high-level political leadership and effective participation of all stakeholders. Capacity was central to effective and successful monitoring and evaluation.

133. Recommendations for effective SDG implementation were: the need to strengthen leadership, participation and implementation framework; means of implementation; good governance, institutional effectiveness and global partnerships; and monitor and evaluate programmes.

Discussions on the Africa Regional Report on Sustainable Development Goals

134. In the ensuing discussion, the participants congratulated the consultant and secretariat for the high quality of the report. Participants also shared the various good practices from their constituencies. In order to further improve the report and take Africa's specific concerns into account and better reflect the region's priorities; the meeting raised issues and provided recommendations as follows:

(a) General comments on the report

135. The comments provided on the subregional reports which informed the report remained valid and should be carefully considered in revising the regional report;

136. The report should be revised taking account of all the comments and inputs provided, and widely disseminated to inform deliberations on SDGs and other development issues in the region;

137. The figures used should be cross checked and consistent with national data, as pointed out by Eritrea;

138. The report should give equal attention to the issues of land degradation, desertification, crossborder rivers and social development, particularly jobs for the youth;

139. Aspects related to increasing productivity should feature in the goals, targets and indicators;

140. Use formulation/language that is agreed. For example, the term sustained inclusive green growth should be used rather than green economy;

141. There should be uniformity in the timelines;

142. The set dates for all the SDGs could be a maximum of 15 years. But there could be differentiated set of dates for the various targets to reflect the urgency to achieve targets such as those related to poverty, hunger, reproductive health and disease among others and take into account availability of resources;

143. The report should provide for periodic opportunity to review progress and learn lessons in the implementation of the goals.

(b) General comments on the proposed goals

144. The mistakes in the past should be avoided. In this regard, the goals should be balanced across the three dimensions of sustainable development and arranged in the order of priority. The set of goals proposed should ensure that Africa achieved the desired results;

145. The MDGs that African countries are not set to achieve should be included first, before dwelling on the others;

146. Generally, there should be coherence of the goals, targets and indicators. The targets should be SMART;

147. Targets must be bold and measurable. However rationale for the proposed targets and indicators should be provided and be realistic and consistent with national policies;

148. The targets and indicators should take into account and address in particular the special circumstances and needs of Small Island States, landlocked/land-linked countries, and countries emerging out of conflict. These should also address growth levels. For instance, issues of disappearance of island States due to sea rise and marine and coastal populations should be taken into account. The special needs of marginalized groups including the disabled should be addressed;

149. There is a need to reprioritize the goals taking into account the social, economic and environmental challenges that countries are faced with.

150. There should be a specific goal on means of implementation;

151. There should also be a specific goal on science, technology, and innovation; or else this important driver of productivity should be mainstreamed into all the goals;

152. The targets and indicators on budget percentages should be reviewed.

153. Countries could not commit without knowing budget implications.

154. Countries did not know all the aspects of green economy and its impact on industries. As such countries could not commit to targets on it. Neither can countries commit to carbon emission reduction targets.

(c) Specific comments on the proposed goals

Goal 1: Eradicate poverty and extreme hunger, and achieve food security and nutrition

155. This should be divided into two goals, namely: to eradicate poverty; and achieve food and nutrition security;

156. The goal on food security should have targets and indicators on increased agricultural production and productivity;

Goal 2: Vigorously promote good governance, peace and security

157. Governance, peace and security could not possibly be a goal, given the difficulty in measuring them;

158. Remove the word "vigorously" this is not applicable to this goal but rather to all the others.

159. Reform of institutions should be covered under this goal.

Goal 3: Provide adequate, qualitative, affordable and accessible health care to all

160. This goal should include targets on HIIV/AIDS, tuberculosis and malaria consistent with the targets agreed by Heads of State and Government in Nigeria in 2013;

161. Health financing should be covered in the indicators.

Goal 4: Enhance accessibility and affordability of quality education for all

162. There was need to look at and develop education from the bottom and ensure that it contributes to improved lifestyles

163. Include "increase" in the number of teachers

164. Provide targets/indicators on building schools

Goal 5: Improve availability and access to clean water and sanitation for all

165. Water shortage in the region should be addressed. In this regard, the need for sustainable management of surface and ground water, and prevention of pollution should be covered under this goal.

Goal 6: Intensify gender equality, women empowerment and youth development

166. Issues of maternal morbidity should be addressed.

Goal 7: Heighten social inclusion and security for all

167. There should be targets and indicators on the needed enhanced focus on urbanization, including addressing slum issues.

Goal 8: Transform from conventional to inclusive green growth and promote sustainable consumption and production

168. Review the formulation of this goal.

169. Issues of technology transfer and research and development should be covered.

Goal 9: Scale up investments in infrastructure development and efficient services

170. Infrastructure: housing, roads, railways, airports, marine transport, energy and information, communication and technology infrastructure should be covered;

171. Technology transfer should be emphasized.

Goal 10: Advance sustainable exploitation, use and management of natural resources; and

Goal 11: Improve quality and sustainability of the environment

172. Goals 10 and 11 should be merged.

173. There should be targets or indicators on sustainable land and marine management, addressing desertification, sustainable use and protection of biodiversity, and sustainable forest management;

174. Need to indicate the need for rules and regulations on the management of the resources;

175. Issues on environment should be mainstreamed into the budgeting process;

176. Moreover, education on the environment should be mainstreamed into school curricular at all levels;

177. Targets/indicators on aviation emission reduction should be concluded through the ongoing negotiations;

178. Maintenance of biodiversity should be added;

179. Assessment of natural resource endowments should be added to address the constraint posed by lack of information for effective natural environment and natural resources management.

Goal 12: Promote global partnerships and institutional effectiveness

- 180. Should focus on partnerships development building on MDG 8;
- 181. Institutions should be transferred and dealt with in goal 2.

(d) Means of implementation

182. Africa must put emphasis on resource mobilization so as to own and drive its development agenda. However, it should be well presented to strike a balance with the additional financial resources that should be provided to the region in line with the agreed commitments, including on ODA. International partners must meet their commitments. This is also pertinent with regard to financing for development. Governments should deal with embezzlement of funds;

183. Development of capacity of countries in various aspects of SDG planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation is crucial and should be strengthened;

184. Well-defined implementation arrangements at all levels were important and should be included in the report.

(e) Monitoring and evaluation

185. Country statistical capacities should be built to collect and disseminate data and information on implementation of SDGs;

186. Clear roles should be assigned to ECA, AUC and RECs with respect to monitoring and evaluation and implementation progress reporting.

187. In response to the issues, comments and recommendations raised, the consultant thanked the delegates for their inputs. He agreed that indeed the issues raised were pertinent and would be addressed. There was a need to balance external resources with domestic resource mobilization. As raised in the comments, carbon emission target would be revised; science, technology and innovation would be looked into and time horizon revisited. However, the proposal for zero targets on diseases would not be easy to achieve.

IX. Statements by major groups on the sustainable development goals

188. Under this agenda item, the representatives of the nine major groups conveyed their perspectives on the sustainable development goals. They included: Women, Non-Governmental

Organizations, children and Youth, Farmers, Local Authorities, Scientific and Technological Community, Workers and Trade Unions, and Business and Industry.

Women group

189. The group called for a human rights-based approach to defining the SDGs, building on the regional and global commitments and various legal instruments on women's rights, anchored on social equity and equality. The group further called for the mainstreaming of gender concerns into all the proposed goals. The proposed SDGs must be part of a broader agenda of structural and transformational change that was firmly rooted in the principle of common, but differentiated responsibilities, and should not be limited to reductive targets and indicators.

190. The proposed SDGs should promote principles that do not discriminate against gender, age, class, race, ethnicity, abilities. The goals should aim at eliminating all forms of discrimination and violence against women. They should ensure respect for the sexual and reproductive rights of all adolescent girls and boys, women and men, and empower all populations living invulnerable conditions by providing them access to basic services and control over productive resources and technologies for sustainable development. The group urged member States to ensure women's participation in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the SDGs.

NGOS Group

191. The group urged the meeting to put citizens at the heart of development and embark on a constructive and forward-looking dialogue on the civil society's role and participation in the region's future development agenda. The group emphasized the need for the civil society to have full access to, and participation in all meetings and official documents and information and foster meaningful policy dialogue, at local and national levels between government and civil society to broaden and build ownership of the process.

192. The group proposed that engagement with AU, UN, its Commissions and thematic Committees in the region should be guided by the diversity of civil society and social movements and the diverse means for outreach offered by the group and meaningful policy dialogue, national and local consultations in the form of pre-meetings and engagement at the local and national level between government and civil society to broaden and build ownership of the process.

193. The group further committed to meaningful civil society engagement in sustainable development processes in the region, and to continue coordinating to ensure the outcomes of the meeting translate into tangible actions. In this regard, they informed the meeting that the group would hold an African-wide, multi-sectoral civil society meeting ahead of the January 2014 AU Heads of State and Government summit to ensure that outcomes of the Africa regional consultative meeting on SDGs were on the agenda of the summit.

Children and Youth

194. The group called for the SDGs process to put children and youth, who make up 70 per cent of the African population, at the heart of the regional sustainable development efforts and make the right investments in youth and children education, health and employment while ensuring their active participation in governance.

195. While welcoming the inclusion of a zero target to eliminate child mortality by 2025 in the SDGs, youth and children urged the region to adopt a comprehensive approach aiming at eliminating preventable child deaths and go beyond the provision of health care to address all aspects of health with a focus on "Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights". The group raised the need for additional indicators that reflect access and quality of Sexual Reproductive Health Services for all.

196. The group recommended the inclusion of targets and indicators that will measure linkages between education and access to productive employment for the youth. It underscored the need to enhance the participation of youth, women and marginalized groups including persons with disabilities in the process of defining SDGs and especially the proposed goal of eradicating poverty and hunger.

Farmers

197. Building on the fact that agriculture employs 70 per cent to 80 per cent of the African population, the group underscored that rural communities, smallholder farmers, and livestock keepers did play a crucial role in fostering sustainable development, improving food security and reducing poverty in rural and urban areas.

198. Building on the position of sustainable agriculture, food security and nutrition on member States' priorities, the group recommended that the SDGs be enriched through specific targets and indicators on growth in investments in sustainable agriculture, enhanced and better balanced distribution of agricultural produce in the region, reduction in post-harvest losses, provision of support to small holder farmers and vulnerable communities and promotion of sustainable production systems in livestock rearing, fisheries and forestry.

199. The group noted that agriculture remained one of the crucial sectors affected by climate change and underscored the need to support farmers and livestock keepers to adapt to and mitigate the effects of climate change in ensuring resilient livelihoods. The group also recommended formulation of targets and indicators that supported farmers as they dealt with the effects of climate change. A special mention was made on the need to reduce the non-medicinal use of antibiotics in livestock production as well as the number of human deaths from zoonotic diseases.

Local Authorities

200. The group recommended the involvement of relevant stakeholders and expertise from civil society, and the local authorities, in order to provide a diversity of perspectives and experience in the process of defining the SDGs.

201. 119. The Group underlined that Africa is was experiencing the highest urbanization growth resulting in proliferation of slums, increasing urban poverty and rising inequality. It underscored the need to factor the concerns of the urban poor and slum dwellers into the SDG process. The set should

therefore integrate a goal with targets reflecting the need for sustainable cities and affordable housing, better access to service delivery by marginalized groups and strengthened social protection mechanism.

Scientific and Technological Community

202.

203. The group noted that science, technology and innovation were essential for sustainable development as they addressed issues at local, regional and global levels through generating scientific knowledge and developing appropriate technologies. The group recommended promoting integrated innovative approaches that fully encompassed existing and new scientific knowledge to bridge the North/South technological capacity divide. The group also asserted that inter-disciplinary and trans-boundary innovative research should underpin sustainable development goals, targets and indicators.

204. The scientific and technological community appreciated the work done thus far in the process of developing the SDGs for the continent as presented in the circulated documents. However, they drew the attention of the meeting to the fact that the strategic role of Science, Technology and Innovation (STI) was missing in from the proposed SDGs and argued that the goals must be based on science right at the outset.

205. The group requested that the final document on SDGs should make a clear distinction between basic education, tertiary education and innovative research as they had different roles that were central to STI and called for increased financial resources for STI in Africa. The group recommended the inclusion of a specific goal addressing science, technology and innovation issues or for its formulation as part of goal 4.

Workers and Trade Unions

206. The Workers and Trade Union Major Groups indicated their firm commitment to the Rio+20 SDGs and the Post-2015 Development Agenda processes and raised the expectations that the two

processes should converge to avoid duplication of efforts and wastage of resources. The group expressed concern that major groups were excluded from the Bureau of the Meeting, inconsistent with the spirit of Article 248 of the Rio+20 Outcome Document, whereby parties committed themselves to establish an inclusive and transparent process for negotiating SDGs that will be open to all.

207. They urged that the SDGs process should learn from the experience of MDGs noting that the MDGs formulation process was non - inclusive not only to CSOs, but to governments in the developing world and was not extended to implementation, monitoring and verification of programmes. They recommended that the region should avoid such kind of engagement in the SDGs and a post-2015 development framework calling for broad stakeholders consultation phase for more active engagement.

208. The group advised that the SDGs should not exclude important themes such as Social Protection and Decent and Green Job creation. The region was further advised to avoid developing goals that completely did not have indicators or had inadequate indicators for measuring their performance. The process should focus on both quantitative achievements and qualitative indicators that will allow the region have a good measure of the quality of achievement. SDGs should include goals, targets and indicators that would cover Sound Management of Chemicals and support the UNEP Strategic Approach to International Chemicals Management.

Business and Industry

209. The group noted that the region should strengthen its ownership over the SDG process and provide space for the local private sector, domestic direct investment with long term socioeconomic agenda and women entrepreneurs in the implementation of the selected goals. It further called for strengthening of regional integration, putting in place a conducive environment for cross-border trade, addressing non-tariff barriers to trade and empowering the local private sector while fostering the future Africa wants.

210. The group called for a conducive environment for local entrepreneurs and domestic investors. In particular, it urged governments to prioritize direct domestic investment and development domestic entrepreneurs in Africa, stating that local investors contribute to mobilizing resources at lower transaction costs to governments. The group cited the proliferating private equity funds on the continent as an opportunity for broadening wider participation in business.

211. The group further called for greater efforts to achieve economic integration in Africa. It specifically called for commitment to promoting regional trade and cross border investment, elimination of non-tariff barriers and other impediments to industrialization and creation of regional value chains. The group also called for greater involvement of the business community in the provision of productive infrastructure, strengthening of public-private partnerships, and a more comprehensive public-private sector dialogue.

X. Consideration of the outcome document of the consultative meeting

212. The meeting considered the draft Outcome Document of the Africa Regional Consultative Meeting on the Sustainable Development Goals. Delegations made comments, observations and inputs which were incorporated in the document. The Draft Outcome Document was adopted as amended for consideration by the Ministerial segment.

XI. Adoption of the report of the experts meeting

213. The experts considered the draft report of the meeting. Delegates made comments, and proposed amendments to the report. The meeting adopted the draft report as amended.

XII. Closing of the meeting

214. The Chairperson thanked all delegations for their active participation and useful contributions. He indicated that the refined draft Outcome Document of the Africa Regional Consultative Meeting on the Sustainable Development Goals would be tabled at the Ministerial segment for consideration and adoption. He then declared the meeting closed.